

Message

**From:** Martyn Smith [martynts@berkeley.edu]  
**Sent:** 4/23/2015 4:36:00 PM  
**To:** Kavlock, Robert [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=eebac67f01094409a7fdaa955a837884-Kavlock, Robert]; 'Paul Lambert' [plambert@wisc.edu]; DeMarini, David [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=750891dc98b14f9696c27583558fb1b5-Demarini, David]; Cogliano, Vincent [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=51f2736376ac4d32bad2fe7cfef2886b-Cogliano, Vincent]; bucher@niehs.nih.gov [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=c421f94a4d20447ca67ed6ab9ee8b03a-bucher@niehs.nih.gov]; 'Chris Portier' [cportier@me.com]; Caldwell, Jane [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=7a8f79de73e34dbaba09a77eae794461-Caldwell, Jane]; Gibbons, Catherine [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=2ac775a35a0945718edc7e02f50e6c12-Gibbons, Catherine]; 'Kate Guyton' [GuytonK@iarc.fr]; Fritz, Jason [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=f8d42341bd2241598226069f9623074a-Fritz, Jason]; iir@unc.edu [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=f8c69879429f4e979533ff1df23d331f-iir@unc.edu]; lambert@oncology.wisc.edu; hecht002@umn.edu; 'Robert Baan' [BaanR@iarc.fr]; 'Kurt Straif' [straifk@iarc.fr]; 'Rusyn, Ivan' [IRusyn@cvm.tamu.edu]  
**Subject:** FW: Decision on EHP ms 15-09912-REV  
**Attachments:** reviewer1.pdf; 15-09912-REV-Smith-formatting-checklist.docx

Dear all

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

I will start working on other revisions and begin circulating a revised version for comment. Please let me know if you think you can address a particular point in any of the critiques.

All the best, Martyn

On 4/22/15, 11:51 AM, "ehpmanuscripts@niehs.nih.gov" <ehpmanuscripts@niehs.nih.gov> wrote:

>22-Apr-2015

>

>Dear Dr. Smith:

>

>Manuscript ID 15-09912-REV titled "Key Characteristics of Carcinogens as  
>a Basis for Organizing Data on Mechanisms of Carcinogenesis" which you  
>submitted to Environmental Health Perspectives, has been reviewed. The  
>comments are included at the bottom of this letter.

>

>The reviewer(s) have recommended some major revisions to your manuscript.  
>Therefore, I invite you to respond to the comments and revise your  
>manuscript. You have six weeks from the date of this letter to complete  
>your revisions. If you require additional time, you must contact us by  
>e-mail [EHPManuscripts@niehs.nih.gov] PRIOR TO THE DUE DATE to request an  
>extension, otherwise your paper will not be available for revision.

>

>Note: Papers for which major revisions are recommended have a low to  
>moderate overall rating that the Associate Editor believes might be  
>improved with significant revisions. Significant revisions may include

>substantial or extensive changes in the text, figures, or tables.  
>Additional experiments, data collection, analyses, or new information may  
>also be required. It is possible that the paper may not be accepted even  
>if additional material is provided since the new information may not  
>support the original conclusions or may uncover other serious problems  
>that would warrant rejection. Additionally, it may be determined that the  
>revised paper falls short of EHP's criteria for publication, which  
>include originality, scientific quality, environmental health  
>significance, clarity of presentation, and conciseness. Manuscripts that  
>are resubmitted after major revisions will be sent back to reviewers for  
>reevaluation.

>  
>Please refer to your revision checklist (attached) for formatting  
>guidelines. Please observe EHP length limitations when revising your  
>manuscript. Revised manuscripts that substantially exceed length  
>limitations may be returned for shortening before being sent out for  
>review.

>  
>To revise your manuscript, log into <http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ehp>,  
>enter your Author Center, and follow the instructions below.

>  
>1. Create a Revision  
>Select "Manuscripts Awaiting Revision." Under "Actions," click on "create  
>a revision." The manuscript will appear under "Revised Manuscripts in  
>Draft" with the original manuscript number appended to denote the  
>revision. [Note: you may also see an option to "Click here to submit a  
>revision" when you log into your Author Center. If that option is  
>available you can select it, and it will automatically create the  
>revision for you.]

> You will need to upload two Word versions of your revised manuscript:  
>one with tracked changes, and one "clean" version (with all changes  
>accepted). We recommend that you begin by generating the revised drafts  
>from a copy of your previously submitted manuscript so you can refer to  
>specific changes in your response to the reviewers. You will be asked to  
>upload these files at a later time.

>  
>2. View and Respond to Decision Letter  
>View your decision letter and enter your response to the letter in the  
>space provided. To avoid losing your work, we recommend that you compose  
>your response using a word processing program, then copy and paste the  
>text into the Response to the Decision Letter box.

> In order to expedite the processing of your revised manuscript, please  
>be as specific as possible in your response to the reviewer(s). We  
>recommend that you copy the editors' and/or reviewers' comments into your  
>response letter and respond to each comment individually, including the  
>specific changes made in response to each comment (if any) and where the  
>changes are located in the revised draft. Adding line numbers to your  
>documents will make it easier to indicate the location of specific text  
>or changes. (In Word, go to Format → Document → Layout → Line Numbers to  
>add line numbers to your document.)

>  
>3. Type, Title, & Abstract  
>Your original title, running head, and abstract will be inserted  
>automatically into the appropriate fields.

> If you have revised your title, running head, or abstract you must  
>delete the old text and insert the revised text into the appropriate  
>field at this time.

>  
>4. Attributes  
>The keywords that you entered for the original submission will be  
>automatically inserted.

>  
>5. Authors & Institutions  
>If you have added new coauthors to the paper you must enter their  
>information here. You may also edit coauthor information or delete  
>coauthors if needed.

> NOTE: You must submit a revised competing financial interest (CFI) form  
>if you have added new coauthors to your paper.

>  
>6. Details & Comments  
>You may enter the text of your cover letter into the space provided or  
>upload your cover letter as a separate file here.

> Your cover letter should confirm that your manuscript has been  
>submitted solely to EHP and is not published, in press, or submitted  
>elsewhere, and that all the research meets EHP's ethical guidelines,

>including adherence to the legal requirements of the study country.  
>  
>Please answer all of the questions on the Details & Comments page, even  
>if they are also addressed elsewhere (e.g., in your cover letter).  
> Please refer to the link provided for additional information about  
>EHP's policies concerning competing financial interests.  
>  
>7. File Upload  
>Upload the revised files shown below. You do not need to replace files  
>that are unchanged from the previous draft.  
>a. A Word version of the revised main document with all changes tracked  
>or highlighted. Please indicate material that has been deleted from the  
>file, in addition to information that has been added. Select "Word -  
>changes marked" as the File Designation for this file.  
>b. A "clean" Word version of the revised main document with all changes  
>accepted. Select "Main Document" as the File Designation for this file.  
>c. Separate JPG, TIFF, PDF, or EPS file for revised figures (if needed).  
>Select "Figure" as the File Designation for each file. You may include  
>more than one "Figure" file. Please be sure to delete old versions of  
>"Figure" files as needed. (NOTE: Tables should be included in the main  
>document, after the references. You do not need to submit separate Table  
>files.)  
>d. If you have added new authors to the paper, or your situation has  
>changed with regard to competing financial interests, you must upload a  
>revised competing financial interest (CFI) form at this time (available  
>at <http://ehp.niehs.nih.gov/cfi.pdf>). Select "CFI Form" as the File  
>Designation for a revised CFI form. [If you are unable to scan and upload  
>a signed CFI form please upload an unsigned copy of the CFI form and fax  
>the signed form to 301-480-3237.]  
>NOTE: Previous versions of "Main Document", "Word - changes marked", and  
>"CFI Form" files must be deleted before you can upload new versions of  
>these files. If a file has not changed from the previous draft, you don't  
>need to delete or replace the file or upload anything new.  
>  
>9. Review & Submit  
>You will be prompted for any missing information at this time. You must  
>also review HTML and PDF versions of your revised manuscript before you  
>will be able to submit your manuscript. (Note: The PDF version is the  
>file that will be sent to reviewers, so you should confirm that it  
>appears the way you want it to. We do not use the HTML file generated by  
>Manuscript Central, but you will still be required to open it before you  
>submit your paper.)  
>  
>Once again, thank you for submitting your manuscript to Environmental  
>Health Perspectives. I look forward to receiving your revision.  
>  
>  
>Sincerely,  
>  
>Dr. Bruce Fowler  
>Associate Editor, Environmental Health Perspectives  
>ehpmanuscripts@niehs.nih.gov  
>  
>  
>  
>  
>Editor's Comments:  
>  
>Please address the comments of the reviewers, revise the manuscript  
>accordingly. Many thanks for your submission to Environmental Health  
>Perspectives.  
>  
>  
>  
>  
>Reviewer(s)' Comments:  
>  
>Reviewer: 1  
>  
>see attached file: reviewer1.pdf  
>  
>  
>  
>  
>Reviewer: 2

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

>  
>  
>  
>  
>  
>Reviewer: 3  
>

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

# **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**